Digitalization Process and Metabureaucracy Approach in Turkish Public Administration[1]

ID Batuhan Bilici

bilicibatuu@gmail.com
Atılım University

Abstract: This article analyzes the structural and functional transformation of the Turkish bureaucracy in the period extending from the Ottoman Empire to the present day. Starting from the classical Weberian definition of the concept of bureaucracy, the basic characteristics of the traditional bureaucratic structure in the Ottoman Empire were considered in a historical context and the effects of factors such as hierarchical order, understanding of merit, centralization policies in this structure on the bureaucracy of the Republican period were evaluated. In the post-1980 period, the transformations experienced in Türkiye's understanding of public administration with the impact of neoliberal policies and globalization have been examined in the context of concepts such as "new public administration" and "post-bureaucracy". Finally, it is argued that developments such as digitalization, e-government applications, artificial intelligence and algorithmic decision-making have transformed the bureaucracy and evolved into a new management concept called "MetaBurocracy". The article provides both a historical depth and sheds light on contemporary theories of public administration. In particular, it reveals the increasing impact of technological infrastructure in today's public administration practices and how this change is reflected in the roles of public officials, decision-making processes and relations with citizens. With the MetaBurocracy concept, a theoretical framework for the future of Turkish public administration is presented, and traces of transformation are followed without breaking away from bureaucratic tradition.

Keywords: Bureaucracy, Metaverse, Digital Transformation, Military and Civil Bureaucracy

JEL Classification: H83, L32

---

[1] *This study was produced from my thesis "The Evolution of Bureaucracy from the Ottoman Empire to the Present Day", which was accepted on 21/01/2021.*

1. Introduction

Throughout history, more than one view has been put forward for the concept of bureaucracy and there has not been a clear consensus on this concept. The bureaucratic process that started with the Ottoman Empire has continued today as electronic state applications. With the reform movements brought by the Tanzimat Period, the functional aspect of the Ottoman bureaucracy started to be reshaped. Both civilian and military institutions that trained civil servants for the bureaucracy were opened in this period. With the proclamation of the Republic, radical changes began for the bureaucracy. The innovation adventure that started with Tanzimat was deemed inadequate by the founding cadres of the Republic and they tried to train bureaucrats who would convey Türkiye's founding philosophy, history and revolutions to the society. In the early years of the Republic, the military bureaucracy was more prominent. For this reason, the bureaucracy of the Republican Period consisted of both civilian and military bureaucracy. This study fills an important gap in the literature by examining the historical continuity and transformation relationship in Türkiye's public administration system. In particular, the study, which analyzes the evolution of bureaucratic structures in the modernization process in both a theoretical and practical framework, contributes to the public administration literature by revealing a new conceptualization such as MetaBurocracy. In addition, it also reveals areas of discussion in the context of contemporary issues such as the impact of e-government applications on bureaucracy in Türkiye. This study has been conducted with a qualitative approach that combines the historical analysis method and the conceptual analysis method. Dec. Firstly, the theories of bureaucracy, management systems of the Ottoman and Republican periods, modernization movements in public administration, neoliberal reforms and digital transformation processes were examined by conducting a literature search. The bureaucratic structure in the Ottoman Empire has been evaluated through historical documents, archival sources and academic studies. Later, the transformations experienced with the Republican period were analyzed in terms of legislative changes, institutional reforms and paradigm shifts in management understanding. In the last section, the concept of MetaBurocracy is presented through the examples of current e-government applications, technological infrastructure developments, artificial intelligence-based decision support systems and digital public administration. While creating the theoretical framework of this concept, postmodern public administration approaches were used. Comparative historical analysis was also used as a method, and the similarities and differences of past and present bureaucratic structures were revealed.

2. Literature Review

2.1. The Concept of Bureaucracy

The word bureaucracy was first used by Vincent de Gournay in 1745. In ancient Greece, the word bureaucracy was used as 'krasi'. Based on these definitions, we can define the word bureaucracy as a form of political life in which employees have political power (Heper, 1983). The concept of bureaucracy shows that the understanding of political power is a structure that reveals its own interests. In another explanation, the concept of bureaucracy means the state and civil servant community (Eryılmaz, 2013).In the German Dictionary dated 1813, bureaucracy is defined as the structure that holds all the powers of the government to the detriment of citizens (Heper, 2011). There are many descriptions of the concept of bureaucracy both objectively and descriptively, for example, bureaucracy has emerged as the assistant and executive of political power in the form of specialisation and division of labour. Bureaucracy has become an important structure and has become an institution to meet the needs of our daily life both socially and economically (Ergun and Polatoğlu, 1992). Today, public bureaucracy plays an important role in the implementation of the policies of the governments. In another definition, bureaucracy is described as 'Management of Bureaucrats'. According to this definition, bureaucracy is a concept that depends on its structural features and is shaped according to its behavioural characteristics (Eryılmaz, 2013). All classifications made for bureaucracy are actually based on the conceptual structure created by Weber for bureaucracy. Bureaucracy is widely used in both public and private sectors in the sense of creating an organisational structure. We can also state that it is used in three different senses as 'Public Administration and Public Officials', 'Stationery' and 'Bureaucratic Management Style' (Akçakaya, 2016). In its dictionary meaning, bureaucracy is defined as 'giving too much importance to correspondence in the execution of state affairs, stationery' (Ataman, 2001). Weber states that people working in groups become organised structures after a while and emphasises that bureaucracy emerges as large organisational structures. The formation of capitalist states is further strengthened by the development of bureaucracy and describes bureaucracy as a structure that acts in the interests of the elite class. Bureaucracy has been the structure that protects and maintains the continuity of high-level officials. According to Marxist theory, he emphasised that just as classes and states emerged in certain periods of history, bureaucracy will disappear due to political and economic reasons (Akçakaya, 2016).

2.2. Digital Transformation and Bureaucracy

Bureaucracies around the world are often criticized for their inflexibility, budget-maximizing waste, and excessive rules and procedures. Rapid developments in

technology, including the expansion of digital government, the use of artificial intelligence and the ability to collect and analyze big data, promise to make public sector organizations leaner, more efficient and more responsive to the needs of citizens (Eryürük, 2005). While these technological changes lead to predicting the end of bureaucracy, the data presented in many countries show that bureaucratic public institutions have not disappeared. Advanced information processing technologies such as artificial intelligence do not eliminate bureaucratic trends in the public sector, but rather strengthen them. While advances in technology can change the way public sector organizations work, they can also serve to strengthen the main purpose of bureaucracy (Eryürük, 2005). Digital transformation has become a necessity, not an option, for governments to respond to crises during the pandemic. It has become imperative for governments around the world to increase their capacity to strategically use emerging digital technologies and develop innovative digital public services to confront and overcome the epidemic. With the rapid development of digital technologies, the digital government transformation was legitimized in response to the pandemic and contributed to innovative efficiency, but at the same time created uncertainty (Karagöz, 2020). It also covers the government capacity and policy implications for managerial and institutional reforms to respond to the threats and uncertainty caused by disruptive digitalization in many countries (Kapani,2013). Within the framework of digital transformation, developed countries have adopted some principles to adopt and manage the developments more easily. These; These are elements such as Data, E-Participation, Artificial intelligence, Blockchain, E-Government. The governments have started to work on concepts such as the digital state by moving away from their understanding of the e-state (Iris and Akdemir, 2020). Thanks to the development of digital citizenship rights and the adoption of an open government model, digital technology offers numerous opportunities both for the organization of administrations and for relations between citizens, enterprises and administrations (Göçoğlu, 2020). Dec. The digital transformation of Public Administration will provide significant savings in public spending resources. Not only the administration, but also citizens would benefit from this savings. In fact, public expenditures impose a burden on citizens through taxation (Göçoğlu, 2020).

3. The Bureaucratic Process from the Ottoman Empire to the Present
3.1. The Bureaucratic Period in the Ottoman Modernization
In the 1800s, the process of deterioration in both military and political terms began in the Ottoman Empire. Corruptions such as bribery and corruption, which started with the classical period, have put the palace on a quest (Terzi, 2014). In this period, which

started with the Industrial Revolution, the Ottoman Empire adapted to the reform process late. The bureaucracy in the Ottoman modernization started with the Edict of Tanzimat. The change in power and bureaucracy seen during the period, the modernization movement, showed that the foundation of their constitutional activities had been laid (Özdemir, 2001). During the development of the bureaucratic structure, bureaucrats have become more possessive in the administration and it has been seen that some of the sultan's powers have been limited. On the other hand, the organization has been tried to be made around the Divan-ı Hümayun. During the Period of Rise, the civilian bureaucracy also acted together with the ruling class, and the military bureaucratic order further increased its influence and brought the ruling group under its influence. There are no mechanisms to balance the absolute powers of both the sultan and the bureaucrats during the ascension period (Özdemir, 2001). With the decline of the Ottoman Empire, the deterioration in many state institutions, including the bureaucracy, increased and there were decreases in the state treasury. With the strengthening of the centralist structure, the structure of the Ottoman Empire led to the strengthening of managers at the state levels. Accordingly, in the face of the problems arising in the central bureaucracy and the negativities caused by complaints, some arrangements have been made for the number of civil servants in government departments and the relations of institutions with each other (Durun, 2009). The announcement of Tanzimat has been an important step in the Turkish bureaucratic modernization process. The bureaucracy has achieved a secure status in this period. Together with the Tanzimat, an effort to create a Western-style bureaucratic structure has begun (Heper, 1983). Bureaucratic structures have been tried to be modernized and modern institutions have been established instead of institutions from the Classical Ottoman bureaucratic structure tradition. III.Selim and II. Important reforms were made for both military and bureaucratic institutions during the periods of Mahmud (Dinler, 2016). The Divan-ı Hümayun has lost its influence, and the administration has become a centralist structure in a political sense. New laws have been created, and hierarchical structures have been tried to be established in which the bureaucracy will come to the fore. II.Together with Abdulhamit, the civil bureaucracy in the Ottoman State had an advantageous structure.

3.2. The Development of Bureaucracy in the One-Party Period

The bureaucracy of the one-party period has been the pioneer of the modernization movement. During the one-party period dominated by the Republican People's Party, the bureaucracy took an active role. The CHP has been both the architect of the established state and the real owner of the bureaucracy (Eryılmaz, 2013). With the proclamation of the Republic, Mustafa Kemal wanted to establish a state model based

on civil bureaucracy. In the first years of the One-Party period, both the civilian authority and the military authority were the sectors that carried out the Republican reforms and modernization. Unlike the Ottoman Empire, the bureaucracy of the Republic has established institutions that will control both the political power and the civil bureaucracy (Ergun and Polatoglu, 1992). With the law "On the Establishment of a Public Inspectorate" prepared on June 26, 1927, the bureaucracy assumed an important role in the provincial organization. in 1868, many regulations were made for the State, which is one of the leading institutions of the bureaucracy. The most important of these regulations was in the content of the "Organization-I Esasiye Law" numbered 491. Later, with this regulation in 1925, it became law by taking the name of "State Law" (Karli, 2015). in 1926, with the "Law of the Officer who does not Participate in the Struggle-i Milliye" numbered 854, the decision was taken to liquidate the people who are against the national struggle in the bureaucracy. According to this law, it has been decided that the officers who have not returned to their duties despite being notified will be liquidated and will not be paid. Special committees have been established for the trials on these issues (Şaylan, 1983). Considering that the bureaucratic cadres in the one-party period were of military origin, it was seen that Türkiye turned into a military-popular structure, and the military bureaucracy continued to exist with the establishment of the Republic (Pustu, 2007).

3.3. The Development of Bureaucracy during the Democratic Party Period

With the coming to power of the Democratic Party, it was seen that the bureaucracy's power decreased compared to the One-Party period (Eroğul, 1990). In its early years, the DP tried to balance the relationship between bureaucracy and power. With the increase in the economic effectiveness of the political power, the effectiveness of bureaucrats has increased significantly, but due to this, the political activity of bureaucrats has started to decrease. The most important feature that distinguishes the DP from other bureaucratic traditions is to prevent bureaucrats from interfering in the country's politics (Eroğul, 1990). The DP has also made the civil bureaucracy feel this attitude quite a lot. until the 1950 elections, the DP considered the bureaucracy as a political material that had not been opposed and stated that it had confidence in the bureaucracy. The DP envisaged following a "liberal policy" in the economy in 1953. In this period, the Democratic Party, which followed a harsh attitude again, dismissed public bureaucrats in policies that did not fulfill their orders and instead of constantly using the bureaucracy in an active system, they aimed to gain control over the bureaucracy (Ileri, 2009). it is possible to evaluate the period from the 1950s to the end of the 1960s when the Democratic Party was in a harsh conflict with the bureaucracy.

3.4. The Development of Bureaucracy Between Dec. 1960 and 1980

in the 1950s and 1960s, tension between the bureaucracy and the political power began and bureaucratic stability Decayed. Accordingly, the army, which comes from the military-elite bureaucratic tradition, has criticized the Democratic Party. With the Constitution of 1961, the bureaucracy began to play an autonomous role in the face of political power, and various policies were initiated for parliament to become the dominant power, and the civil bureaucracy became powerful in the face of power (Eroğul, 1990). Although the bureaucracy is in constant contact with the political authorities along with the Turkish tradition of modernization, it is seen that it faced the government in both the 1960s and 1980s coups. With the intervention of 1960, continuous policies were developed for the public benefit and the growth of the bureaucracy accelerated, and it is possible to see this growth rate in a concrete increase in the number of civil servants (Eryilmaz, 2013).

3.5. The 1971 Memorandum and the State of Bureaucracy

The intervention of March 12, 1971 was actually not very surprising for Türkiye. The main goal of the soldiers was to end the conflict between the people, to bring together the opposing views and to create a government that adopts the Decrees of Mustafa Kemal (Ahmad, 2014). The main goal of the soldiers was to end the conflict between the people, to bring together the opposing views and to create a government that adopts the Decrees of Mustafa Kemal. March May 12, along with the left-elitist bureaucratic sector believes that the May 27 intervention did not achieve its goals (Heper, 1983). With the coalition periods, new political parties started to place their own personnel in the bureaucracy and party officials began to dominate instead of bureaucrats with merit (Şaylan, 1983). as we moved forward to the 1980s, it was seen that the bureaucracy was shaped around Atatürk's thought. The most important of the changes created by the Army has been the "Martial Law Law No. 1402". The military tried to gain control over the rights and freedoms of the person based on the authority granted by this law (Yılmaz, 2020).

3.6. The State of the Bureaucracy Between Dec. 1980 and 2002

in the 1980s, there were developments in our country that led to radical changes in both political and bureaucratic fields. Both the September 12 intervention and the 1982 Constitution marked this period. When we look at September 12, it has come to the forefront ideologically (Akşin, 2014). the class struggle and leftist movements that rose in the 1970s increased social violence and various events marked this period. Political murders have increased, religious groups and other organizations have come into conflict (Aydın and Taşkın, 2014). Migrations from villages to cities have increased,

problems have arisen in the population structures of cities, and at the same time, negative living conditions have started to continue (Sever, 2019). Due to the fact that the president could not be elected for a long time, despite the increase in social events and political murders, the political power could not find a solution, the military intervened in the administration on September 12, the parliament was dissolved and the parties were closed (Aydın and Taskın; 2014). in the 1990s, the main goal of the civil bureaucracy was to fight inflation. Economic stability could not be achieved and basic economic functions began to collapse. With the development of the understanding of market economy, institutions called Regulatory and Supervisory Institutions have been established in our country and have started a growth in public bureaucracy, these institutions having different statuses from the classical understanding of bureaucracy have created a new structure. This situation has also made the elite bureaucracy a powerful institution in determining politics (Eryılmaz, 2013). In the new order established by the Constitution, sovereignty was also shared with the members of the NSC, and the army became powerful within the civilian bureaucracy. In this way, military bureaucrats continued to control civilian politics (Pustu, 2007). A sharp Decoupling between the army and the bureaucracy has started and the functioning of public institutions has started to affect the bureaucracy (Eryılmaz, 2013).

4. The Transition Process to Electronic Government Applications in Türkiye

At the beginning of the 2000s, it was decided to conduct a central examination for the recruitment of civil servants to the public bureaucracy, and this situation was accepted as the return of the merit system to bureaucracy in our country during the period. E-government applications have also given a new impetus to the concept of governance. Governance has gained an electronic dimension in the new understanding of public administration. The aim of governments is to transform the way the administration is transparent and accountable and aimed at. Public policies have started to be popularized and state administration has continued its effectiveness on the citizen (Doğan, 2013). During this period, the MERNS Project, which is one of the programs of the political power and is based on inter-institutional cooperation, has been put into operation. Dec. Within the scope of the project, citizens were tracked with their identity numbers (Öktem, 2014). in 2002, the AK Party Government mentioned in its program that economic stability would be at the forefront and that the traditional public bureaucracy should undergo transformation, because the traditional bureaucracy has not been in transformation and the restructuring process has been initiated (Eryılmaz, 2013). The "Information Acquisition Law No. 4942" was enacted for confidentiality and transparency

practices in the public bureaucracy at the same time, the "Ethics Committee of Public Servants No. 5176" was established in order to determine the rules that bureaucrats should follow in management and to protect ethical values (Candan, 2013). When we look at it, the Ombudsman Institution has been a transformation for the bureaucracy, and at the same time, the bureaucracy has been an important step in solving the problems that will arise, and although the main purpose of this institution seems to be to correct the harm of citizens, it has taken an important position in preventing the practices that bureaucrats will do for their own interests (Zeren, et al., 2020).

5. The State of Turkish Bureaucracy Within the Framework of Metaburocracy and Artificial Intelligence Concepts

The concept of the metaverse was first mentioned by Neal Stephenson in his work Snow Crash. Here people create their own avatars and interact with each other in a virtual world. Metaverse is defined as a spatial computing platform that provides digital experiences as an alternative to the real world or a copy of the real world, along with aspects such as social interactions, currency, trade, economy and property ownership, which form the basis of blockchain technology (Buyukbaikal and Sönmezer, 2022). The metaverse is a combination of two words as "meta" and "universe". This world is a structure where virtual and augmented reality combine. It is possible to experience in the Metaverse using VR/Dec devices and 3D technologies. In addition, the recent development of the use of artificial intelligence and digital technology has created new costs and challenges, partly due to the fact that the progress of artificial intelligence applications has been facilitated by the availability of public and private sector data (Bozkurt and Gümüş, 2022). These costs and challenges have led to social debates about the degree to which artificial intelligence produces not only accurate and timely information, but also unbiased outputs. According to different segments, it takes into account that recent artificial intelligence-supported applications have emerged that they can produce biased decisions as a result of extensive and continuous use of biased data at the social level. When we look at it, it is the responsibility of the government to comprehensively assess what difficulties citizens may face in special circumstances when public services will rely mainly on digital access (Kavut, 2022). Public institutions should be aware of the need to combine digital systems with personal and individual support to ensure access to digitalization. When we look at it, artificial intelligence may be one of the most powerful tools for policy makers to follow a data-based policy approach, machine learning will provide a precise image of what the country needs and how its problems can be solved with predictive analytical techniques (Kavut, 2022). Artificial intelligence, which is one of the basic phenomena of digital transformation, has

been directly related to the development goals of countries (Atabay and Aytekin, 2022). With globalization, we see that ministries, public institutions and organizations are changing with the changing technological conditions of today (Büyükbaikal and Sönmezer, 2022). The slow functioning of the bureaucracy is turning into effective structures with the use of new technologies. With the new principles of public administration, the use of technology is becoming a necessity, and accordingly, the Digital Transformation Office established within the Presidency conducts studies on issues related to all public institutions and reports directly to the Presidency. It has taken on the role of combating issues such as bulkiness and stationery, which are the main problems of Turkish public administration (Taş et al.,2017). The Digital Transformation Office has started to work on concepts such as artificial intelligence, metaverse to conduct studies on Digital Türkiye. The office, which started with the slogan of domestic and national, has tried to reduce foreign dependence with software. 11. In the Development Plan, policies on issues such as artificial intelligence applications, national and domestic projects, cloud computing have been included. The main ones of these policies (Avaner and Fedai, 2019);

- – Preparation of roadmaps related to artificial intelligence, big data analysis, storage and augmented reality technologies and establishment of infrastructure, making preparations within the framework of the National Technology Move,
- – Making technological improvements by using technologies such as bulul informatics and apay intelligence and ensuring smooth access of public services to citizens,
- – Production of artificial intelligence technologies by preparing national policies and development projects,
- – Road maps will be prepared on a national scale in the field of artificial intelligence by making domestic and national production.

The Public Digital Transformation Leader is the head of the Digital Transformation Office. In this context, the leader is responsible for increasing efficiency, creating strategies and implementing decision-making processes within ministries and public institutions. The concepts of artificial intelligence and big data in these areas, which are still very new in our country, have shown that it is the beginning of a new change in the policies to be put forward together with the state (Avaner and Çelik, 2021). The projects of the Digital Transformation Office related to artificial intelligence develop citizen-state, university and industry cooperation. We can cite applications such as digital twin and data security as an example of this situation (CBDDO, 2019). One of the main tasks of the Digital Transformation Office has been to provide services efficiently, effectively

and quickly using artificial intelligence. In this area, we will be able to see the Digital Transformation Office as the executor of the artificial intelligence and metaverse concepts of our country (Avaner and Çelik, 2021). The concepts of artificial intelligence and meta are quite new for our country. Our public institutions and organizations continue their new experiments with the projects they have put forward. When we look at it, although limited, very important steps are being taken in public administration to begin with. It is seen that digital technologies and artificial intelligence projects are integrated into the bureaucracy. It is suspected that there will be a decline in artificial intelligence in public administration because the developments of legislation and ministry structures lag behind in the face of the workings of technology and new developments on the bureaucracy. Accordingly, with the Presidential Decree No. 4, it has been stated that TUBITAK will work in coordination with all other policy boards. Studies have been initiated for the establishment of an "Artificial Intelligence Institute" in the field of both artificial intelligence and meta-world (Digital Transformation Office, 2020). In addition, the Digital Transformation Office mentioned that "with the projects to be put forward in 2023, citizens will realize that they spend less carbon emissions as they use e-Government." In this sense, it has also been one of the steps taken towards becoming a green e-Government in the world. Accordingly, we see that e-government is in a transformation to be used within the framework of climate change. The e-government applications in our country have been shown as an example to the member states. It is seen that carbon emissions are saved in the use of both paper and bureaucracy (Taş et al.,2017). Artificial intelligence policies in our country, it is possible to say that it supports areas such as increasing R & D studies, developing entrepreneurship, creating technical infrastructure, creating the necessary legal infrastructure for the field of artificial intelligence, developing international collaborations (Zeren et Dec., 2020). According to the Presidential Decree No. 7, the "Artificial Intelligence Platform" has been established within the Presidency of Defense Industries. Here, it is aimed to make project preparations within the framework of software and meta concepts about integrating into the digital world. It is aimed to invest in R&D projects in the process of Decoupling and supporting advanced technology achievements, and to reduce the burden of bureaucracy. This platform will work in coordination with the digital transformation office and TUBITAK and will try to achieve achievements within the framework of the National Artificial Intelligence Strategy Document (Karasoy and Babaoglu, 2020). It is seen that support is obtained from all bureaucratic institutions for the establishment of data centers and the creation of hardware infrastructure. "Big Data and Artificial Intelligence Applications Department" develops strategies for using artificial intelligence applications and meta concept effectively in bureaucratic institutions, attaches importance to artificial intelligence

applications in public projects, and also provides coordination on open data at the national level (Zeren et al., 2020). The most important purpose of the Digital Transformation Office is to create a roadmap and strategy for digital transformation and the use of artificial intelligence in public institutions and organizations Decently and to create an inter-institutional digital ecosystem. In this ecosystem, which we call Meta-Bureaucracy, the reduction of bureaucratic transactions and the non-printing of documents as paper come to the fore. The introduction of policies aimed at artificial intelligence has become especially important for young people. It is very important to inform young people, create mobile applications using artificial intelligence, explain the digital bureaucracy, and spread artificial intelligence and the metaverse world using different platforms. The spread of artificial intelligence has increased interaction both for the administration and for the citizens and has become effective for the administration to inform citizens using the Internet and provide services (Karasoy and Babaoglu, 2020). Together with artificial intelligence technology, petitioning public institutions and organizations has made it easier to access information in terms of time and space. Together with Covid19, it has revealed the need for artificial intelligence technologies for the provision of public services. We see that the importance of digital management has increased with the epidemic, and the administration shows that it is aware of digital transformation with artificial intelligence applications (Tanriverdi, 2015). With the establishment of the "General Directorate of National Technology of the Ministry of Industry and Technology", it is responsible for carrying out activities in the fields of new technology to ensure capacity development on a national scale, coordination between bureaucratic institutions and the presentation of new technologies and the production of economic value (Zeren et al. Dec., 2020). Within the scope of the National Technology Move, tasks such as taking measures for the growth of the ecosystem for transformative technologies, including data, metaverse, supporting the development of enterprises, ensuring the increase of domestic and national production capacity, contributing to the training of researcher human resources; in this direction, carrying out programs and projects with high impact at the country level have been given (National Artificial Strategy 2021-2025). In order to create an artificial intelligence ecosystem in our country, it is important to establish a structure that will cover the power of the state, the position of the bureaucracy, universities, associations, professional chambers. The sharing of bureaucratic data and dissemination of high-quality and accurate data stand out from the point of view of the ecosystem (TBD, 2020). Some institutional structures have been established in many public institutions in our country to regulate bureaucratic interaction with technological moves (National Artificial Strategy 2021-2025). These;

- Big Data and Artificial Intelligence Applications Branch Directorate within the Ministry of Justice,
- Artificial Intelligence and Wearable Technologies Unit has been established within the Ministry of Health.

6. Result

Within the scope of this study, the structural transformations of the Turkish bureaucracy in the historical line extending from the Ottoman Empire to the Republican period were examined, followed by the 21st Century. the new trends that have emerged in the bureaucracy with the effect of digitalization in the century have been evaluated. The concept of bureaucracy has been considered as a multi-layered structure that regulates social relations, shapes the functioning of political powers and reflects state-society interaction, rather than being only a technical tool of public administration. Within this framework, the historical development of the bureaucracy has been evaluated not only through administrative reforms, but also together with the socio-political and ideological contexts of the period. The evolution of the bureaucracy in the Ottoman Empire gained momentum with the efforts of centralization, modernization and institutionalization, especially in the post-Tanzimat period. The modern bureaucratic structures created during this period were transferred as a legacy to the Republican period and assumed a central role in the construction process of the new state. In the early years of the Republic, the bureaucracy functioned as a tool that built the ideological orientations of the state in the eyes of society; it became the field practitioner of statist policies in areas such as education, health, industrialization and development. This process has gone beyond the Weberian definition of bureaucracy and created a bureaucratic structure shaped by ideological orientations. In this context, digital transformation in bureaucracy makes it possible to provide public services in a faster, transparent, participatory and accountable way. The integration of advanced technologies such as artificial intelligence, big data, blockchain and open data systems into public processes brings not only technical, but also normative transformations. The effective use of these technologies in decision-making processes ensures that public policies are designed in a more data-based and evidence-based manner. However, this transformation process is not limited only to the adaptation of technological developments; it also requires the transformation of corporate culture, human resources and legal infrastructure in accordance with this change. Digital bureaucracy, unlike the hierarchical, centralized and formalist structure of traditional bureaucracy, brings with it a more flexible, horizontal and user-oriented understanding of public administration. In this context, the citizen is now moving out of a position that only receives services

and becoming an active stakeholder in the shaping of public policies. Digital participation mechanisms pave the way for democratization in public administration, while at the same time strengthening elements such as transparency, accountability and public trust. However, it is of great importance that problems such as digital inequalities, privacy violations, algorithmic Deciencies and data security are not ignored in this process. However, the rise of digital bureaucracy also brings with it some fundamental debates. At the beginning of these discussions, the myth of the neutrality of technology is included. The systems created through digital technologies should be carefully questioned about which ideological orientations, normative acceptances and relations of interest are involved in the background. In particular, the use of artificial intelligence algorithms in decision support systems raises the question of whether they will serve the public interest or the guidance of certain interest groups. Therefore, digital bureaucracy should be considered not only as a technical progress, but also as a transformation with ethical, political and sociological dimensions. Considering the projections for the future, it is expected that public administration will become even more integrated with advanced technologies such as artificial intelligence, augmented reality, Internet of things and metaverse. Through these technologies, public services are becoming both individualized and predictable. However, this situation also raises the question of how to harmonize the anonymous and impartial structure of the bureaucracy with personalized service models. Moreover, in an environment where digitalization is gaining momentum, the risk of Deceleration of normative control mechanisms should not be ignored. As a result, the transformation of the bureaucracy with digitalization not only means increasing administrative capacity, but also radically redefines the epistemology of public administration, sources of legitimacy and citizen-state relations. Digitalization policies developed in order to eliminate the shortcomings of the traditional bureaucratic structure have the potential to have revolutionary results in public administration when managed correctly. However, the success of this process will be possible not only with technological investments, but also with the integrated strengthening of the ethical, legal, social and institutional infrastructure. Within this framework, digitalization does not represent the end of bureaucracy; it represents the rebirth of a more fair, transparent, participatory and effective bureaucracy. In order for this transformation to be maintained in a healthy way, it is necessary to increase digital literacy in public administration, strengthen governance capacity and build data-based decision-making processes in which the citizen is placed at the center. The bureaucracy of the future must be a structure shaped by technology, but guided by human-centered values.

References

Akçakaya, M.(2016). Bürokrasi Kuramları ve Türk Kamu Yönetiminde Bürokratik Sorunlar. *Gazi Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi, 3,* 669– 694.

Akşin,S. (2014). *Kısa Türkiye Tarihi.* (18. Basım). İstanbul: Kültür. Ahmad,F.(2014). *Modern Türkiye'nin Oluşumu.* (13. Basım). İstanbul:Kaynak.

Aydın,T.(2014). Atatürk Döneminde Bürokrasi ve Modernleşme (1923–1938). Kahramanmaraş Üniversitesi. Kahramanmaraş.

Avaner, T. & Fedai, R. (2019). Türk Kamu Yönetiminde Ofis Sistemi: E-Devlet Uygulamalarından Dijital Dönüşüm Ofisine. *Amme İdaresi Dergisi,* 52(2), 149 – 172.

Avaner, T. & Çelik, M. (2021). Türkiye'de Dijital Dönüşüm Ofisi ve Yapay Zekâ Yönetimi: Büyük Veri ve Yapay Zekâ Daire Başkanlığı'nın Geleceği Üzerine. *Medeniyet Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 6 (2), 1–18. DOI: 10.52539/mad.1050640.

Bozkurt, Ö. & Gümüş, İ. H. (2022). Metaverse Ve Metagirişimcilik: Kavramsal Bir Çerçeve. *Girişimcilik ve Kalkınma Dergisi*, 17 (1), 75–85. Retrieved from https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/girkal/issue/71395/1079743.

Candan,H. (2013). İş Dünyası ve Bürokrasi İlişkileri Bağlamında Girişimcilerin Türk Kamu Bürokrasisi Algısına Yönelik Bir Araştırma. *Karamanoğlu Mehmet Bey Üniversitesi.* Karaman.

Doğan,K. (2013). Türkiye'de 1980 Sonrası Kamu Yönetiminde Reform Politikalarına Yön Veren Kavramsal / Teorik Düşünceler ve Kurumsal Düzenlemeler. *Türk İdari Dergisi*, 479, 123– 154.

Eryılmaz,B.(2013). *Kamu Yönetimi Düşünceler, Fonksiyonlar, Yapılar, Politikalar.* (6. Basım). İstanbul: Umuttepe.

Eryılmaz, B. (2013). *Bürokrasi ve Siyaset, Bürokratik Devletten Etkin Yönetime.* (5. Basım). İstanbul: Alfa.

Ergun, T. ve Polatoğlu,A.(1992). Kamu Yönetimine Giriş. Ankara: Todaie.

Göçoğlu, V. (2020). Kamu Hizmetlerinin Sunumunda Dijital Dönüşüm: Nesnelerin İnterneti Üzerine Bir İnceleme. *MANAS Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 9(1), 615–628. DOI: 10.33206/mjss.538784

Heper,M. (1983). Türkiye'de Devlet Geleneği. (3. Basım). Ankara: DoğuBatı.

Heper,M. (2011). Türkiye'nin Siyasal Hayatı. (4. Basım). Ankara: Doğan Kitap.

Kavut, S. (2022). Metaverse Teknolojisi Kullanımının McLuhan'ın Teorileri ve Yaklaşımları ile Analizi. *Yeni Medya*, 2022 (12), 140–155. DOI: 10.55609/yenimedya.1087756

Karagöz, U. (2020). Türkiye'de Kamu Yönetiminin Dijital Dönüşümü: Ulusal Veri Santrali Model Önerisi (Yüksek Lisans Tezi). Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi

Pustu,Y.(2007). Osmanlı-Türk Devlet Geleneğinde Modernleştirici Unsur Olarak Bürokratik Elitler. *Gazi Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi, 9* (2), 197–214.

Sever,M. (2019). 1980 Sonrası Türkiye'de Kültürel ve Toplumsal Değişme. *Uluslararası Halkbilimi Araştırmaları Dergisi,* 3-10.

Sis Atabay, E. & Sarı Aytekin, S. (2022). Metaverse: Örgüt Kültürünün Gelenekselden Dijitale Evrimi. *Uluslararası İktisadi ve İdari İncelemeler Dergisi*, (36), 21-36. DOI: 10.18092/ulikidince.1130922.

Şaylan,G.(1983). Cumhuriyet Dönemi Türkiye Ansiklopedisi.İstanbul: İletişim

TBD, Türkiye'de Yapay Zekânın Gelişimi İçin Görüş ve Öneriler, Kavramsal Rapor, 2020.

Yılmaz,L. (2020). Türk Siyasal Hayatında Askeri Darbelerin Siyasal ve Anayasal İşlevi. *Çağdaş Türkiye Tarihi Araştırmaları Dergisi, Özel Sayı,* 203-231.

Zeren, H. E., Tekin, Y. & Özdek, F. (2020). Kamu Yönetiminin Dönüşümü Bağlamında Türkiye'de Kamu Denetçiliği Kurumunun Faaliyetlerine İlişkin Bir Değerlendirme.*Kamu Yönetimi ve Politikaları Dergisi , Kamu Yönetiminde Dönüşüm Özel Sayısı,* 34-49. Retrieved from https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/kaypod/issue/57297/748059.